AUDIT COMMITTEE	AGENDA ITEM No. 7
21 NOVEMBER 2016	PUBLIC REPORT

Cabinet Member(s) responsible:		Cllr David Seaton, Cabinet Member for Resour	ces
Contact Officer(s):	John Harrisor	n, Corporate Director Resources	Tel. 452520
	Steven Pilswo	orth, Service Director, Financial Resources	Tel. 384564

#### **USE OF CONSULTANTS - UPDATE REPORT**

RECOMMENDATIONS				
FROM : Corporate Director Resources	Deadline date : N/A			
<ol> <li>That Audit Committee consider the update report on the October 2015 – 30 September 2016.</li> </ol>	ne use of Consultants for the period 1			

#### 1. ORIGIN OF REPORT

1.1 This report is submitted to Audit Committee following the Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee review into Peterborough City Council's use of consultants, the subsequent endorsement of their recommendations by Cabinet, and the agreement of Audit Committee to undertake an on-going monitoring role.

#### 2. PURPOSE AND REASON FOR REPORT

- 2.1 Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee recommended that the on-going monitoring role at Member level is undertaken by Audit Committee. Audit Committee considered their approach to this role at their meeting of 26 March 2012. This report is in line with the approach agreed and subsequent updates, and is in accordance with the Committees' Terms of Reference:
  - 2.2.1.11 To review any issue referred to it by the Chief Executive or a Director, or any Council body; and
  - 2.2.1.15 To consider the Council's arrangements for corporate governance and agreeing necessary actions to ensure compliance with best practice.

#### 3. TIMESCALE

Is this a Major Policy Item /	NO	If Yes, date for relevant	N/A
Statutory Plan?		Cabinet Meeting	

#### 4. REVIEW OF THE USE OF CONSULTANTS

- 4.1 In March 2010, the Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee requested a review into Peterborough City Council's use of consultants. A cross-party review group was established to undertake this work on behalf of the Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee.
- 4.2 The report from the Consultancy Review Group was issued in March 2011. Scrutiny also recommended that on-going monitoring of the use of consultants should fall to Audit Committee. Audit Committee considered this role at their meeting of 26 March 2012.
- 4.3 A further report, outlining the information requested, was discussed at the meeting of 5 November 2012. Further updates have been considered at the meetings of 4 February 2013, 4

November 2013, 3 November 2014 and again on November 9 2015. This report continues the regular reporting to Audit Committee.

#### 4.4 Use of consultants

The definition of consultancy is based upon standard procurement classification. As such it covers a wide range of companies and services. Expenditure is included here if the company meets the standard classification, irrespective of exactly what services have been provided.

4.5 The spend for the last seven full years, plus in current year to date, for both consultancy and interim spend is shown below. The trend over that period is for a reduction in spend.

	Consultancy £m	Interim £m	Total £m
2009-10	7.1	1.4	8.5
2010-11	5.3	1.1	6.4
2011-12	4.7	0.7	5.4
2012-13	3.5	0.8	4.3
2013-14	3.3	1.2	4.5
2014-15	1.9	1.1	3.1
2015-16			
April 15 – September 15*	0.5	0.5	1.0
October 15 – March 16	0.6	<u>0.9</u>	<u>1.5</u>
TOTAL 2015-16	1.1	1.4	2.5
2016-17 (6 month period to end September 2016)	0.6	1.1	1.7

<sup>\*</sup> Breakdown provided to Audit Committee 9 November 2015

- 4.6 Consultancy spend continued to reduce in 2015-16. Interim spend in 2015-16 has increased since the previous year and in the six month period to September 2016 has further increased mainly due to interim roles within the People and Communities department. There are a number of interim roles supporting the council's transformation programme which includes customer experience, adult social care transformation and change management and communications. Although the transformation programme is being led with the People and Communities department some of the interim roles sit within other departments, for example communication and change management roles. In addition there have been a number of interim roles in senior management positions. The Quality Assurance team and Commissioning team interims were filling vacancies due to restructures within the teams.
- 4.7 The council as part of its budget setting for 2016/17 budgeted for consultancy and interim spend to support the customer experience programme, a major transformation project for the future delivery of services by the council and is an invest to save basis initiative. Investment is needed to support the project as it will be implemented over the next few years. The council invested £1.5m in 2016/17 and £1.0m in 2017/18 to deliver £2.0m and £5.1m savings respectively.
- 4.8 It should be noted that the exact pattern of spend depends entirely on what projects are underway in the council. These projects may be one-off, but given the scale of some projects they may continue across more than one year. Spend on consultants occurs across both the revenue and capital budgets of the Council, some of which is externally grant funded.
- 4.9 The policy agreed by Cabinet and Audit Committee to manage use of consultants, including the need for a business case to be produced, remains in place. The Corporate Management Team have reviewed all arrangements as part of the 2016/17 budget process, and considered the necessary exit strategies to reduce reliance on interims.
- 4.10 A list of companies used for the period 1 October 2015 to 30 September 2016 is included in appendix 1, indicating the breadth of these companies and services that are included in the standard classification and in the analysis in this report. Appendix 2 includes the breakdown of

spend by department for the same period, and Appendix 3 includes those interims in role for more than one year as at 30 September 2016.

#### 5. CONSULTATION

5.1 Audit Committee considered options for how they wish to monitor use of consultants in the future at their meeting of 26 March 2012. Subsequent discussions at the meetings referred to have refined the information they wish to monitor.

#### 6 ANTICIPATED OUTCOMES

6.1 That Audit Committee consider the update report on the use of consultants.

#### 7 REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 The recommendations are in line with the recommendations of Scrutiny, and the view of Audit Committee in undertaking this role.

#### 8 ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS CONSIDERED

8.1 Audit Committee considered options for how they wish to monitor use of consultants in the future at their meeting of 26 March 2012.

#### 9 IMPLICATIONS

- 9.1 Where appropriate, the policy outlines implications for areas such as Legal, Human Resources, Procurement and Finance.
- 9.2 This report does not have implications for specific wards.

#### 10 BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS

Used to prepare this report, in accordance with the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985)

- Consultancy Review Report, March 2011;
- Report to Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee, 8 November 2011;
- Report to Sustainable Growth Scrutiny Committee, 6 March 2012; and
- Reports to Cabinet and Audit Committee 26 March 2012.
- Report to Audit Committee of 5 November 2012
- Report to Audit Committee of 4 February 2013
- Report to Audit Committee of 4 November 2013
- Report to Audit Committee of 3 November 2014 and supplementary report to Audit Committee of 2 February 2015
- Report to Audit Committee of 9 November 2015

#### 11 APPENDICES

- Appendix 1 list of companies used during the period 1 October 2015 and 30 September 2016 with project breakdown; and
- Appendix 2 Spend by department
- Appendix 3 consultants/interims in place for more than one year as at 30 September 2016.

# Appendix 1 - List of companies with project descriptions Period of 1 October 2015 – 31 March 2016 (2015/16) being spend since the last Audit Committee report

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
Artelia UK	Space study of council premises	27,360		27,360
Artelia UK Total		27,360		27,360
Athene Communications	Communication support - Provision of media cover and internal communications on the transformation programme (The total spend between Athene Communications and Westco trading period in this report is £160k - £60k to cover media roles including maternity cover, £48k on the customer experience programme, £22k covering a vacant post, £30k on projects such as media training, energy campaign and internal communications)		47,650	47,650
Athene Communications Total			47,650	47,650
Baltimore Consulting	Educational Psychology	15,000		15,000
	Passenger Transport review	4,500		4,500
	Interim Head of Admissions		50,600	50,600
<b>Baltimore Consulting Total</b>		19,500	50,600	70,100
Cambridgeshire County Council	Sacre and Religious Education course programme development 2015-16		3,400	3,400
Cambridgeshire County Council Total			3,400	3,400
Caritas Recruitment	High cost placements, Reablement and Assistive Technology (Adult Social Care)		22,800	22,800
Caritas Recruitment Total			22,800	22,800
Chatham Associates Ltd	Interim Finance Manager role in Financial Services - support to the Serco PSSP contract and Energy initiative projects		20,250	20,250
Chatham Associates Ltd Total			20,250	20,250
Claudia Wade Ltd	School improvement	29,972		29,972
Claudia Wade Ltd Total		29,972		29,972
Deloitte LLP	Professional services - Waste project	22,962		22,962
	Professional services - Fletton Quays project	9,777		9,777
	Professional services - Energy projects	51,093		51,093

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
Deloitte LLP Total		83,831		83,831
East Cambridgeshire District Council	Local Plan Viability Assessment	14,925		14,925
East Cambridgeshire District Council Total		14,925		14,925
Enterprise	Asset Management surveying	20,253		20,253
Enterprise Total		20,253		20,253
GatenbySanderson Ltd	Interim Assistant Director - Property Services		30,510	30,510
GatenbySanderson Ltd Total			30,510	30,510
Green Park Interim and Exec Ltd	HR consultant to support the customer experience programme which includes new ways of working and terms and conditions  Interim Head of Service (ASC) – this role is supporting delivery of		99,970	99,970
	commissioning savings projects		17,690	17,690
	Interim Manager Strategic Commissioning – these are covering vacant roles		12,790	12,790
Green Park Interim and Exec Ltd Total			130,450	130,450
Kealey-HR	HR Support and union liaison	375		375
Kealey-HR Total		375		375
Lind Associates	SEND consultancy	52,837		52,837
Lind Associates Total		52,837		52,837
Number 10 Interim Ltd	3 consultants to support the project - Social care system reporting including implementing business objects	16,250		16,250
Number 10 Interim Ltd Total		16,250		16,250
Panoramic Associates Limited	Public Health		6,960	6,960
Panoramic Associates Limited Total			6,960	6,960
Patten Resource Management	Transformation Director - Adult Social Care and Customer Experience		48,300	48,300
Patten Resource Management Total			48,300	48,300
Penna Pic	Review of governance arrangements	49,938		49,938
Penna Pic Total		49,938		49,938
ReThink Recruitment	Commissioner		3,325	3,325

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
ReThink Recruitment Total			3,325	3,325
Richard Ellis-Braithwaite	Asteria project - Implementation of a data matching tool to help with identifying fraud and errors	14,031		14,031
Richard Ellis-Braithwaite Total		14,031		14,031
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	Better Care Fund	17,719		17,719
	Commissioner		15,400	15,400
	Interim Manager Strategic Commissioning		44,448	44,448
	Interim Head - Social Care		17,000	17,000
	Strategic Lead Adult Safeguarding		18,480	18,480
	Quality Assurance Officer		51,490	51,490
	Project Manager - communities	24,296		24,296
	Quality Assurance Manager		16,317	16,317
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd Total		42,015	163,135	205,150
Serco Ltd	Adult Social Care Procurement Support		68,717	68,717
	Interim Head of Service (ASC) – this role is supporting delivery of commissioning savings projects		63,312	63,312
	Interim Manager Strategic Commissioning – these are covering vacant roles		28,719	28,719
	Transformation Director - Adult Social Care and Customer Experience		20,330	20,330
	Transformation Lead (Adult Social Care and Customer Experience)		77,287	77,287
	Interim Finance Manager role in Financial Services - support to the Serco PSSP contract and Energy initiative projects		8,325	8,325
	Children's Social care improvement	12,086		12,086
	Delivery Vehicles - alternative models of delivery of services within people and communities	73,202		73,202
	Waste 2020 project to provide the council engineering advice / supervision of contractor during commissioning and testing phase of Energy from Waste plant	48,086		48,086
	Connecting Cambridgeshire Broadband project	43,277		43,277
	Project manager support on the HR case management system	16,402		16,402
Serco Ltd Total		193,053	266,689	459,742

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
South Cambs District Council	Gypsy and Traveller Accommodation Needs Assessment	4,690		4,690
<b>South Cambs District Council Total</b>		4,690		4,690
Terry Reynolds Education Consulting Ltd	Interim Assistant Director - Education		30,886	30,886
Terry Reynolds Education Consulting Ltd Total			30,886	30,886
WESTCO TRADING LIMITED	Communication support (The total spend between Athene Communications and Westco trading period in this report is £160k - £60k to cover media roles including maternity cover, £48k on the customer experience programme, £22k covering a vacant post, £30k on projects such as media training, energy campaign and internal communications)		36,845	36,845
WESTCO TRADING LIMITED Total			36,845	36,845
V4 Services Ltd	Connecting Cambridgeshire Broadband project	9,630		9,630
	Project manager support on the HR case management system	16,200		16,200
V4 Services Ltd Total		25,830		25,830
Grand Total		594,860	861,800	1,456,660

## Period of 1 April 2016 – 30 September 2016 (2016/17 to date)

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
	ICT consultancy (Salesforce applications provided by Arcus			
Arcus Global Itd	Global)	14,400		14,400
	Professional service support for the council around structuring			
	and maintenance of the Salesforce environment (Salesforce			
	Environment Review and Domain Management)	12,642		12,642
Arcus Global Itd Total		27,042		27,042
Artelia UK	Space study of council premises	1,725		1,725
Artelia UK Total		1,725		1,725
	Communication support - Provision of media cover and internal communications on the transformation programme (The total spend between Athene Communications and Westco trading period in this report is £160k - £60k to cover media roles including maternity cover, £48k on the customer experience programme, £22k covering a vacant post, £30k on projects such			
Athene Communications	as media training, energy campaign and internal communications)		69,388	69,388
Athene Communications Total	g, energy company and a second control of the second control of th		69,388	69,388
	Programme Manager - Council's Front Door including better			
Badenoch & Clark Ltd	health and social care integration	37,718		37,718
Badenoch & Clark Ltd Total		37,718		37,718
Baltimore Consulting	Educational Psychology	-1,000		-1,000
-	Interim Head of Service - Older People		29,070	29,070
	Passenger Transport review	43,575		43,575
	Interim Head of Admissions		67,100	67,100
Baltimore Consulting Total		42,575	96,170	138,745
Cambridgeshire County Council	Sacre and Religious Education course programme development 2015-16		3,400	3,400
Cambridgeshire County Council				
Total			3,400	3,400
Caritas Recruitment	High cost placements, Reablement and Assistive Technology (Adult Social Care)		53,000	53,000
Caritas Recruitment Total			53,000	53,000

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
Deloitte LLP	Professional services - Waste project	0		0
	Professional services - Fletton Quays project	0		0
	Professional services - Energy projects	0		0
Deloitte LLP Total		0		0
Eden Brown Ltd	Quality Assurance Officer		23,760	23,760
Eden Brown Ltd Total			23,760	23,760
Enterprise	Asset Management surveying	3,450		3,450
Enterprise Total		3,450		3,450
GatenbySanderson Ltd	Interim Assistant Director - Property Services		41,850	41,850
GatenbySanderson Ltd Total			41,850	41,850
<b>Grant Thornton UK LLP</b>	Professional services - Housing Joint Venture	38,692		38,692
	Professional services - Norse Joint Venture	3,500		3,500
<b>Grant Thornton UK LLP Total</b>		42,192		42,192
Green Park Interim and Exec Ltd	HR consultant to support the customer experience programme which includes new ways of working and terms and conditions		66,560	66,560
	Interim Head of Service (ASC) – this role is supporting delivery of commissioning savings projects		30,500	30,500
	Interim Manager Strategic Commissioning – these are covering vacant roles		98,410	98,410
Green Park Interim and Exec Ltd Total			195,470	195,470
Kealey-HR	HR Support and union liaison	1,125		1,125
Kealey-HR Total		1,125		1,125
Lind Associates	SEND consultancy	77,854		77,854
Lind Associates Total		77,854		77,854
NHS Cambs & P'boro CCG (Clinical Commissioning Group)	Better Care Fund	20,385		20,385
NHS Cambs & P'boro CCG (Clinical Commissioning Group) Total		20,385		20,385
NPS Group	Property client and commissioning role		7,691	7,691
	Interim PFI Manager		4,003	4,003
NPS Group Total			11,694	11,694

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
Number 10 Interim Ltd	3 consultants to support the project - Social care system reporting including implementing business objects	119,265		119,265
Number 10 Interim Ltd Total		119,265		119,265
Patten Resource Management	Transformation Director - Adult Social Care and Customer Experience		51,175	51,175
Patten Resource Management Total			51,175	51,175
Penna Pic	Review of governance arrangements	35,014		35,014
Penna Pic Total		35,014		35,014
Peopletoo Ltd	Early Help Review and Children's Demographic Analysis	27,000		27,000
Peopletoo Ltd Total		27,000		27,000
Ray Worsley Education Consultancy	Education	1,800		1,800
Ray Worsley Education Consultancy Total		1,800		1,800
ReThink Recruitment	Commissioner		24,938	24,938
ReThink Recruitment Total			24,938	24,938
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd	Commissioner		17,500	17,500
	Interim Manager Strategic Commissioning		3,250	3,250
	Interim Head - Social Care		41,000	41,000
	Independent Chair		29,421	29,421
	Strategic Lead Adult Safeguarding		43,680	43,680
	Quality Assurance Officer		52,867	52,867
	Project Manager - communities	35,966		35,966
	Interim Head of Commissioning		80,518	80,518
	Health and Social Care	15,708		15,708
	Quality Assurance Manager		31,635	31,635
Sanctuary Personnel Ltd Total		51,674	299,871	351,545
Serco Ltd	Adult Social Care Procurement Support		3,166	3,166
	Transformation Lead (Adult Social Care and Customer Experience)		16,008	16,008

Supplier name	Project / Initiative	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
	Delivery Vehicles - alternative models of delivery of services			
	within people and communities	21,891		21,891
	Waste 2020 project to provide the council engineering advice / supervision of contractor during commissioning and testing phase			
	of Energy from Waste plant	6,869		6,869
Serco Ltd Total		28,761	19,174	47,934
Socitm Ltd	ICT Interim to additional client team project support		24,000	24,000
Socitm Ltd Total			24,000	24,000
STC (Wirksworth) Ltd	Passenger Transport review	5,975		5,975
STC (Wirksworth) Ltd Total		5,975		5,975
Terry Reynolds Education Consulting Ltd	Interim Assistant Director - Education		60,981	60,981
Terry Reynolds Education Consulting Ltd Total			60,981	60,981
Thawait's Consulting Ltd	Interim Child Health Transformation Lead		49,000	49,000
Thawait's Consulting Ltd Total			49,000	49,000
WESTCO TRADING LIMITED	Communication support (The total spend between Athene Communications and Westco trading period in this report is £160k - £60k to cover media roles including maternity cover, £48k on the customer experience programme, £22k covering a vacant post, £30k on projects such as media training, energy campaign and internal communications)		6,841	6,841
WESTCO TRADING LIMITED Total	de modia daming, energy campaign and internal communications)		6,841	6,841
White, Steve J	Adolescent Services		14,107	14,107
White, Steve J Total			14,107	14,107
,	Transformation Lead (Adult Social Care and Customer		,	
Willowmead Consultants Ltd	Experience)		72,485	72,485
Willowmead Consultants Ltd Total			72,485	72,485
V4 Services Ltd	Connecting Cambridgeshire Broadband project	59,947		59,947
	Project manager support on the HR case management system	15,998		15,998
V4 Services Ltd Total		75,944		75,944
Grand Total		599,499	1,117,303	1,716,802

### **Appendix 2 - Spend by department**

This table breaks down the consultancy and interim spend shown in appendix 1 outlined in section 4.5 by department:

Period	Department	Consultant	Interim	Grand Total
Oct 15 - Mar 16	Governance	66,344	99,970	166,314
	Growth & Regeneration	39,868		39,868
	People & Communities	189,348	619,890	809,238
	Public Health		6,960	6,960
	Resources	299,300	134,980	434,280
Oct 15 - Mar 16 Total		594,860	861,800	1,456,660
Apr 16 - Sep 16	Governance	48,639	71,660	120,299
	Growth & Regeneration	42,142		42,142
	People & Communities	386,504	939,973	1,326,477
	Resources	122,214	105,670	227,884
Apr 16 - Sep 16 Total		599,499	1,117,303	1,716,802
<b>Grand Total</b>		1,194,358	1,979,103	3,173,461

As outlined earlier in this report (paragraph 4.7), the People and Communities department lead the council's customer experience programme with all consultancy and interim roles supporting the programme being charged to this department which is where the budget has been allocated to. Although some roles are interim, these are not substantive roles once the programme has completed.

#### Appendix 3 - Interims utilised for more than a year as at end of September 2016

The following appendix lists roles that were being utilised at the end of September 2016, and were being utilised in some form 12 months earlier. Note that not all individuals will have been employed continuously in that period, some will have worked for ad hoc periods as necessary, and/or operate on a part time basis. All of the roles below are supporting the council's transformation programme which was a two year project.

- Transformation Lead (Adult Social Care and Customer Experience
- Transformation Director Adult Social Care and Customer Experience
- Interim Head of Service (ASC)
- HR Consultant

As outlined earlier in this report (paragraph 4.7), the above roles are supporting the council's customer experience programme. Although some roles are interim, the above roles are not substantive roles once the programme has completed.

This page is intentionally left blank